



The Norman Paterson School of
International Affairs

INAF 5206: Civil-Military Relations

Winter 2023

Prof. Stephen Saideman

Thursdays 11:35, **RB3110**

Office: **Online**

Office Hours: by appointment

Email: steve_saideman@carleton.ca

Course Description:

The purpose of this course is to introduce the students to one of the most overlooked but crucial sets of issues for any political system: democracy, autocracy, democratizing, etc. The military is an important actor in any society, as it can determine who governs and has an important influence on foreign policy. Over the course of the past fifty years, the phrase “civil-military relations” has evolved to mean several different things:

- Is the military a threat to take over the government via coup d’etat? How does one keep the military in the barracks? How do militaries govern?
- For advanced democracies, the question became: how do civilians make sure the military does what it is supposed to do? What is the proper rule of each in the relationship? Are there gaps between how the civilians and military look at the world and are these differences consequential.
- More recently, civil-military relations is often taken to mean how best to integrate the different agencies of governments as they engage in peace-building and counter-insurgency. Whole of government, Three D and all the rest are more salient these days as a result of experiences in Iraq, Afghanistan, East Timor, and elsewhere.

This course will address all three meanings of civil-military relations [CMR] via readings and discussions about the most salient issues and difficult tradeoffs. Much attention will be on the US case simply because so much has been written on it, but we will also spend time on Canadian civil-military relations and on a variety of cases around the world.

The zoom link for the occasional online class will be on the Brightspace page.

Prerequisite: MA standing in the Norman Paterson School of International Affairs or permission of the School.

Readings:

Books:

Sandra Perron, *Outstanding in the Field: Memoir by Canada’s First Female Infantry Officer*

Thomas Juneau, Philippe Lagassé, Srdjan Vucetic, editors, *Canadian Defence Policy in Theory and Practice*

Blogs/Twitter: You should get in the habit of following key analysts on twitter and the blogosphere. See the course Brightspace site for some suggested links.

All assigned readings will be available either via Ares or the Brightspace site.

Learning Outcomes:

1. To better understand the different conceptualizations of civil-military relations.
2. To be able to analyze the various theories presented over the course of the term on the different aspects of civil-military relations.
3. To apply the various concepts to events in the world today and in the recent past, both to assess the applicability of the concepts and to gain insights into the key dynamics of these events.
4. To improve one's research and writing skills in both short and long forms via the course assignments.
5. To develop one's ability to articulate one's views via course participation and the presentations at the end of the term.
6. To develop one's ability to discern the policy implications from conflicting arguments.

Expectations

The course is explicitly comparative. While many of the examples and readings will come from North American experiences, the purpose of this class is to develop a comparative perspective on a problem facing all countries—how to manage the military. Readings will vary from purely theoretical to applied case studies to quantitative analyses. Students should read not just for content (what is the argument) but for **style** (how this argument constructed might influence how one develops one's own work) and **analytically** (is this a good argument? What are the strengths and weaknesses of the methodology? How can it be applied to other cases or more recent events?) In some weeks, the lectures and discussion will be on specific themes or questions. In others, we will go through each piece of reading.

Evaluation

The course requirements consist of reading, participation and writing. It is your responsibility to do the work. If you need some sort of accommodation, such as extension, or face some kind of challenge, please see the professor early, when there are more options available. **Do not wait until the last minute or after the fact.**

Participation (30%):

This course is a seminar. *The quality of the experience depends on what you put into it.* You should complete all the readings for each week ahead of time so that you come into class armed with questions, informed opinions, and perhaps even an improved background on the relevant issues. I will provide discussion questions each week—they will be online via Brightspace. If I find that some students are not participating, I will begin the discussion of each piece (article or book) by randomly choosing someone to start the conversation.

If you miss class, you will not gain any credit for that course meeting. If you cannot attend the class on a regular (that means every week) basis, drop this class and find one that works with your schedule. *In this pandemic, I will be more flexible about students missing*

class, but please don't take advantage. And it is better to notify me ahead of time than ask for forgiveness afterwards.

Merely showing up is not participation. To get an A grade for participation, the student must be engaged, providing informed input that is relevant, on a consistent basis. If you do not participate, do not expect a grade better than a C on this part of the course. And keep in mind that a C in a graduate class is akin to an F in an undergraduate class.

Part of participation in any class involves courtesy: be on time, don't leave early, don't interrupt others as they present their views, don't try to dominate the conversation, etc.

Weekly Memos (25%):

For three weeks (none for the first week or the presentation weeks), students will email the instructor a one-page assignment by **noon** the day before the class. These should be **lists/bullets**—not paragraphs. Keep them to **one page, single-spaced**. For each reading (unless there are more than four—if so, then just cover four of the readings),

In your memo, you should:

- a) Give **one important insight** and/or fact that you gained from **per reading** in one sentence each. What do you know understand or know that you didn't before doing this reading? What was most valuable to you about this reading?
- b) Give **one major critique per reading**. Consider methodology, logic, biases, omissions. Does the author prove his/her argument convincingly? Avoid lazy or cheap criticisms like quantitative work is not useful or that the case may not be generalizable. If the latter, you must argue why it is not generalizable.
- c) If you heard the author present this work at a conference, what probing question would you ask him or her?
- d) Finally, given all of the readings of the week, what is the **one policy implication (only one per week)** you would want to tell a government official?

Pass/fail. Your final grade for this component will be equal to the number of passing assignments divided by the total number of assignments: passing/3.

I will not accept memos that do not follow the instructions.

Because they are meant to encourage you to think about the readings *before* you come to class, **no late reviews will be accepted.**

Each one is due by Wednesday, noon. **Email me the PDF via Stephen.saideman@carleton.ca**, not a word doc and don't use the Brightspace email facility for this—attachments via that system can be problematic.

Presentation (10%):

We will spend the last weeks of the term with students presenting their research paper.

Instructions on the presentation will be circulated a few weeks into the term. The grade on the presentation will focus on whether the presentation was clear, coherent, and interesting.

Meme of the week (5%). Students will have to submit two memes, each one taking one of the course concepts and making a meme out of it. I will provide a link to a website that makes it easy to make memes, and I will provide more instructions at the start the term. Each week, I

will decide which is the best meme with the top student getting a 2.5% added to their participation grade (no student can win more than once). Students **cannot** do memes for the same weeks for which they do the weekly memos.

Research Paper (30%):

A 10-12 page paper on a topic of your choosing, applied to any issue related to this class in the distant or recent past. The paper will NOT be about something that is currently in process in the world and will NOT be speculative. It is a research paper. It will consist of two parts: the paper itself and a one page "chapeau" that summarizes the key points of the paper (that one page does not count for the 10-12 pages). This will be explained in class. We will discuss paper topics in class in week 3 (so have an idea by then).

See the end of the syllabus for the usual Carleton boilerplate info.

Week 1 Jan 12th: Introduction to Civil-Military Relations

This session will focus on getting the basics down: what is this class, what are the expectations, why are you taking it, what your backgrounds are, what are my background and biases. What is meant by civilian control? What are the different meanings? Who are the key actors? What are their motivations? What are the ideal types of civil-military relations? What constitutes a crisis in civil-military relations? What are some of the factors shaping different countries' civil-military dynamics? Consider the tradeoffs between control and effectiveness.

Marybeth P. Ulrich, "General Stanley McChrystal Affair," *Parameters* Spring 2011

Deborah Avant, "Indicators for Civil-Military Crisis," *Armed Forces and Society*, 24:3, Spring 1998: 375-388.

Alice Friend Hunt, "What Makes a Civilian?"

<https://warroom.armywarcollege.edu/articles/what-makes-a-civilian/>

Watch this video: John Paul Jones (from Thirteen Days, re the Cuban Missile Crisis)

https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=10&v=BYRCTHj7k8Y&feature=emb_logo

Open Letter, To Support and Defend: Principles of Civilian Control and Best Practices of Civil-Military Relations, War on the Rocks, Sept 6 2022,

<https://warontherocks.com/2022/09/to-support-and-defend-principles-of-civilian-control-and-best-practices-of-civil-military-relations/>

Supplemental:

LTC Paul Yinglin, "A Failure in Generalship." *Armed Forces Journal*, May 2007

Feaver, P. D. 1999. "Civil-military relations." *Annual Review of Political Science* 2:211-41.

Janowitz, Morris. 1961. *The Professional Soldier*. New York: Free Press.

Rebecca Schiff, "Concordance Theory, Targeted Partnership and COIN," *Armed Forces and Society* 2012, 38

Week 2 Jan 19th: Professionalism vs. Shirking

Foundational discussion: how do we define the relationship between civilians and military? Here's a question to keep asking yourself as you read Huntington: if the military promotes professional behavior, why have so many modern militaries, including the Canadian armed forces, had such severe sexual misconduct crises?

Huntington, Samuel. 1957. *The Soldier and the State*. pp. 7-19, 80-97.

Feaver, Peter. 2003. *Armed servants : agency, oversight, and civil-military relations*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, Chapters 2-3.

Brooks, Risa. 2020. "Huntington's Paradoxes of Professionalism," *International Security*

Brooks and Grewal. 2022, "Twice the Citizen: How Military Attitudes of Superiority Undermine Civilian Control," *Journal of Conflict Resolution*

Brewster, Murray. "Senior female officer quits Canadian Forces, says she's 'sickened' by reports of sexual misconduct." CBC News. 16 March 2021.

Supplemental:

Kohn, Richard H. "On Resignation." *Armed Forces & Society* (August 2016).

Week 3 Jan 26th: Autocratic Civ-Mil, Coup D'Etat and Rebellion,

When do militaries try to take power? When do they succeed? How can they be deterred? What are the consequences for different strategies of coup prevention?

Naunihal Singh, *Seizing Power*, 1-40

Caitlin Talmadge, "Puzzle of Personalist Performance," *Security Studies*, 22:180–221, 2013.

Philip Roessler, "The Enemy Within: Personal Rule, Coups and Civil War in Africa," *World Politics* 63, 2, April 2011: 300-346

Naunihal Singh, "The Myth of Coup Contagion," *Journal of Democracy* 33:4, 74-88, 2022

Supplemental

Vipin Narang and Caitlin Talmadge, "Civil-Military Pathologies and Defeat in War: Tests Using New Data," *Journal of Conflict Resolution* (2018)

Erica De Bruin, "Preventing Coups d'etat: How Counterbalancing Works," *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 2017 <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022002717692652>

Kristine Harkness, "[The Ethnic Army and the State](#): Explaining Coup Traps and the Difficulties of Democratization in Africa." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 60(4): 587-616

Megan Shannon, Clayton Thyne, Sarah Hayden and Amanda Dugan, "The International Community's Reaction to Coups," *Foreign Policy Analysis*, 2014 doi: [10.1111/fpa.12043](https://doi.org/10.1111/fpa.12043)

Carey, Sabine C., Michael P. Colaresi, and Neil J. Mitchell. "Risk mitigation, regime security, and militias: Beyond coup-proofing." *International studies quarterly* 60.1 (2016): 59-72.

Theo McLaughlin, "Loyalty Strategies and Military Defection," *Comparative Politics* 2010.

Finer, S., S.E. Finer, and J. Stanley. 2002. *The man on horseback: The role of the military in politics*: Transaction Publishers.

Johnson, T.H., R.O. Slater, and P. McGowan. 1984. "Explaining African military coups d'etat, 1960-1982." *The American Political Science Review*:622-40.

Terence Lee, "Military Cohesion and Regime Maintenance: Explaining the Role of the Military in 1989 China and 1998 Indonesia," *Armed Forces & Society*, Vol. 32, No. 1, (2005)
Jonathan Powell, "Determining the Attempting and Outcome of Coups" *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 56, 6 (2012): 1017-1040
Barany, *The Soldier and the Changing State*

Week 4 Feb 2nd: Canadian Civil-Mil Relations

What have the concepts we developed thus far say about Canada? Is there a crisis in Canadian civ-mil relations? What does the Kandahar decision tell us about Canadian civilians and control of the military? Is there any accountability when it comes to national defence? What is the role of parliament?

Gosselin, D. 2009. "Hellyer's Ghosts: Unification of the Canadian Forces is 40 Years Old." *Canadian Military Journal*, Vol, 9, No. 2, 6-15.
Lagasse, "Holding Canadian Governments to Account" in *Canadian Defence Policy in Theory and Practice* edited by Thomas Juneau, Philippe Lagassé, Srdjan Vucetic, 45-62
JC Boucher, "Public Opinion and Canadian Foreign Policy," *Canadian Defence Policy in Theory and Practice* edited by Thomas Juneau, Philippe Lagassé, Srdjan Vucetic, 159-178
CDSN/Nanos Survey, <https://www.policyschool.ca/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Report-Survey-on-Civil-Military-Relations.pdf>, skim to get the general tendencies and see if there are any findings that are of interest.
[Canada's Defence Policy Statements: Change and Continuity - HillNotes](#)
MND Mandate letter <https://pm.gc.ca/en/mandate-letters/2021/12/16/minister-national-defence-mandate-letter>

Supplemental:

Bland, Douglas L. "A Unified Theory of Civil-Military Relations." *Armed Forces and Society* 26, no. 1 (Fall 1999): 7-25
Kim Nossal, Charlie Foxtrot, chapters 1 and 5
Okros, Hill and Pinch, *Between 9/11 and Khandahar: Attitudes of Canadian Forces Officers in Transition*, 2008, ISBN: 978-1-55339-215-6
Bland, D.L. 1995. *Chiefs of Defence: Government and the Unified Command of the CAF*
Bland . 2001. "Patterns in liberal democratic civil-military relations." *Armed Forces & Society* 27 (4):525-40.
Gosselin, Daniel. "Listening to the Chief of the Defence Staff: The 'Blurred' Boundaries of Military and Defence Advice." *Canadian Military Journal* 20, no. 4 (Fall 2020): 4-19.
Graham, R. 2002. "Civil Control of The Canadian Forces: National Direction and National Command." *Canadian Military Journal* 3 (1):23-30.
Roussel, S. 2004. "Canada's grand strategy and strategic culture - Guest editor's introduction." *International Journal* 59 (3):477-8.
Shaw, G.D.T. 2001. "The CAF and Unification." *Defense Analysis* 17 (2):159-74.
Sokolsky, J. 2004. "Canada's army - Waging war and keeping the peace." *Int J* 59 (4):974-8.
Stein and Lang, *The Unexpected War*

Week 5 Feb 9th: Societies and Militaries

How does the relationship between the military and society affect the military and society?

Jason Lyall, *Divided Armies*, Chapter 2

Talia Lavin, "The US Military has a White Supremacy Problem" *New Republic* May 17, 2021
<https://newrepublic.com/article/162400/us-military-white-supremacy-problem>

Lt. Commander Johnathan Plows, "The Canadian Forces, Populism, and Right-Wing Extremism," CFC paper, posted on Brightspace page

Harkness, Kristen. 2016. "The Ethnic Army and the State: Explaining Coup Traps and the Difficulties of Democratization in Africa." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 60(4): 587-616.

Week 6 Feb 16th: Gender and Civ-Mil

What is the role of gender in the military? In civil-military relations?

Sandra Perron, *Outstanding in the Field: Memoir by Canada's First Female Infantry Officer*
Stéfanie von Hlatky, "The Gender Perspective and Canada's Armed Forces: Internal and External Dimensions of Military Culture", in *Women and Gender Perspectives in the Military: An International Comparison*, edited by Robert Egnell, and Mayesha Alam, Georgetown University Press, 2019.

Allan English, Status of Violence Against Women in the CAF: "Not a Lot of Progress has Been Made" <https://swscanada.blogspot.com/2020/12/status-of-violence-against-women-in-caf.html>

Lane, A. (2020). Women in the Canadian Armed Forces. In *Canadian Defence Policy in Theory and Practice* edited by Thomas Juneau, Philippe Lagassé, Srdjan Vucetic

Supplemental:

Stéfanie von Hlatky, *Deploying Feminism* - Introduction.

Winter Break

Week 7 March 2nd: Int'l Dynamics of Civil-Military Relations

This week focuses on both domestic -> IR and IR-> domestic. How does domestic politics affect multilateral military endeavors? Are their systematic variations in the way countries manage their participation? How do international forces shape civil-military relations within countries?

Auerswald and Saideman, NATO and Afghanistan, chapters 1-2

Chiara Ruffa, "Military Cultures and Force Employment in Peace Operations," *Security Studies* 26:3, 2017, 391-422

Rachel Epstein, "NATO Enlargement & The Spread of Democracy" *Security Studies* 14:1, 2005: 63-105

Majeta, Peter. "Between Doctrine and Practice: The UN Peacekeeping Dilemma." *Global Governance* 21 (2015): 351-370

Jackson, General Sir Mike. "The Realities of Multinational Command: An Informal Commentary." In *The Challenges of High Command: The British Experience*, edited by Gary Sheffield and Geoffrey Till. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003

Supplemental:

Aurturo Sotomayor, "Why Some States Participate in UN Peace Missions While Others Do Not? An Analysis of Civil-Military Relations," *Security Studies* (2010)

Arturo Sotomayer, *The Myth of The Democratic Peacekeeper*

Nicole Jenne, "Civilianizing the armed forces? Peacekeeping, a traditional mission for the military," *Defense Studies* (2020)

Massie, Justin. "Why Democratic Allies Defect Prematurely: Canadian and Dutch Unilateral Pullout from the War in Afghanistan." *Democracy and Security* 12, 2 (2016):

Week 8 March 9th: Domestic Operations

Avishay Ben Sasson-Gordis, "Citizenship, Enmity, and the Normative Theory of Domestic Military Use," *Armed Forces and Society*, 2022

Adam MacDonald, "The Canadian Armed Forces and the COVID19 Pandemic: Entrenching the Military as Canada's De Facto Emergency Management Organization," CDAI, <https://cdainstitute.ca/analysis-the-canadian-armed-forces-and-the-covid19-pandemic-entrenching-the-military-as-canadas-de-facto-emergency-management-organization/> April 2021

Christian Leuprecht and Peter Kasurak, "The Canadian Armed Forces and Humanitarian Assistance and Distance Relief: Defining a Role," <https://www.cigionline.org/articles/canadian-armed-forces-and-humanitarian-assistance-and-disaster-relief-defining-role/>, August 2020.

More TBA

Week 9 March 16th: Culture Change and Other Reforms Online

Charlotte Duval-Lantoiné, Reforming the Office of the Ombudsman: Establishing Meaningful Oversight of the Canadian Armed Forces, CGAI https://www.cgai.ca/reforming_the_office_of_the_ombudsman_establishing_meaningful_oversight_of_the_canadian_armed_forces

Arbour Report, <https://www.canada.ca/content/dam/dnd-mdn/documents/reports/2022/iecr-report.pdf>

Lagasse, "Improving Parliamentary Scrutiny," *Canadian Military Journal* 22:3, 20-27, 2022
Minister of National Defence Advisory Panel on Systemic Racism and Discrimination – Final Report – January 2022 - Exec Summary. <https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/corporate/reports-publications/mnd-advisory-panel-systemic-racism-discrimination-final-report-jan-2022.html>

Taber, Nancy, "Trusted to Serve: Rethinking the CAF Ethos for Culture Change," *Canadian Military Journal*, Vol 22, No 2, Spring 2022

Weeks 10, 11, 12 March 23rd, 30th, April 6th: Presentations

Research Paper is Due April 14th 1:30pm

Brightspace

This course uses Brightspace, Carleton's learning management system. To access your course on Brightspace go to <http://carleton.ca/Brightspace>. For help and support, go to <http://carleton.ca/Brightspacesupport/students>. Any unresolved questions can be directed to Computing and Communication Services (CCS) by phone at 613-520-3700 or via email at ccs_service_desk@carleton.ca.

Communications

Please use your Carleton email account for all course-related correspondence.

Plagiarism and Complementarity

The University Senate defines plagiarism as “presenting, whether intentional or not, the ideas, expression of ideas or work of others as one’s own.” This can include:

- reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else’s published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one’s own without proper citation or reference to the original source;
- submitting a take-home examination, essay, laboratory report or other assignment written, in whole or in part, by someone else;
- using ideas or direct, verbatim quotations, or paraphrased material, concepts, or ideas without appropriate acknowledgment in any academic assignment;
- using another’s data or research findings;
- failing to acknowledge sources through the use of proper citations when using another’s works and/or failing to use quotation marks;
- handing in substantially the same piece of work for academic credit more than once without prior written permission of the course instructor in which the submission occurs.

Plagiarism is a serious offence which cannot be resolved directly with the course’s instructor. The Associate Deans of the Faculty conduct a rigorous investigation, including an interview with the student, when an instructor suspects a piece of work has been plagiarized. Penalties are not trivial. They include a mark of zero for the plagiarized work or a final grade of "F" for the course. The Academic integrity policy can be accessed at

<http://www2.carleton.ca/studentaffairs/academic-integrity>.

Complementarity: students are encouraged to build up expertise in areas that may cross multiple courses. It is acceptable to write assignments on related topics. However you may not simply cut and paste your work from one assignment to another, or essentially submit the

same work for two or more assignments in the same or different courses. If you plan on writing on related topics in different courses, you must inform the instructors and discuss what will be acceptable in terms of overlap, and what is not. Failure to notify the faculty members will be viewed unfavourably should there be a suspicion of misconduct

Academic Accommodation

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request, the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website:
<http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Religious obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website:
<http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The **Paul Menton Centre** for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your ***Letter of Accommodation*** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>